Author's response to reviews

Title: Does policy grow on trees?

Authors:

Bartha Knoppers (Bartha.knoppers@mcgill.ca)

Version: 4  Date: 26 November 2014

Author's response to reviews: see over
November 24th, 2014

Ms Danica Jose,

In response to your communication of November 17th of the reviewer's comments, I offer the following reply which I trust meets their expectations and responds to their helpful suggestions without unduly lengthening a correspondence piece.

Reviewer Walker: (changes 1 – 3)

1) I have clarified the issue of attribution of the “policy-tree” perception by adding: “the scientific research and funding communities” in line 3. I have also added: “include all relevant stakeholders” in line 10 as depending on the subject matter of the policy, such stakeholders may change.

2) More detail is provided re the decision to choose a human rights approach by clarifying that this has hitherto had very little precedent in the framing of scientific research. (see sentences prior to “Lesson’s learned”).

3) Likewise, a sentence has been added at the end of parag. #5 as to the history and context

Reviewer Taylor:

a) The art and science aspects have been further elaborated in the 4th parag (borrowing in part a suggested phrase you provided – merci!)

b) The “universality” of both the content of the Framework and the approach have hopefully been addressed in the clarifications prior to “Lessons Learned” and prior to “Conclusion”.

Personally, I found the reviewers comments particularly enlightening (and yet encouraging) from an academic perspective even though upon reflection this correspondence piece is probably more a “cri de Coeur” than an indepth scholarly piece.

[Signature]

Department of Human Genetics
Centre of Genomics and Policy
740, Dr Penfield Avenue, Room 5214
Montreal, Quebec, Canada H3A 0G1
T: 514 398-8866  F: 514 398-8954
bartha.knoppers@mcgill.ca
www.mcgill.ca

Département de génétique humaine
Centre de génomique et politiques
740 Avenue du Dr. Penfield, bureau 5214
Montréal, (Québec) Canada H3A 0G1
T: 514 398-8866  F: 514 398-8954
bartha.knoppers@mcgill.ca
www.mcgill.ca