Reviewer’s report

Title: Joint issues - Conflicts of interest, the ASR hip and suggestions for managing surgical conflicts of interest

Version: 4 Date: 1 May 2014

Reviewer: Martin McKneally

Reviewer's report:

This is a well thought out and well written commentary on a high profile case of COI in the introduction of an innovative orthopedic device. The data are clearly explained, and useful proposals to mitigate the harmful influence of COI are offered and critically analyzed.

A specific and clear surgical example, based on the ASR case, of how “relevant work in moral neuropsychology” could be beneficial for management of COI would strengthen the authors' argument that this area of study might usefully be included in surgical training.

Level of interest: An exceptional article

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.

The authors comment favorably on my papers in this field. My assessment is independent of these comments.