Reviewer's report

Title: Patients' perceived purpose of clinical informed consent: Mill's individual autonomy model is preferred

Version: 1 Date: 12 February 2013

Reviewer: Gil Siegal

Reviewer's report:

The abstract is not written well. Please revise
Page 4 "correction of exaggerated individualism". I would suggest a different approach - individualism is not a problem. Lacking the abilities to make a sound judgement on your own is the problem.... See J. Childress' writings
Page 4 "Surgical informed consent" - better "IC for surgery".
Same for "clinical IC Page 5.
Page 6 "It was noted that the word “consent” derives from the Latin con sentire, which means to think or feel together, suggesting that the purpose of informed consent is to arrive at agreement" - I would put this earlier in the paper.
Page 7 "Point of view is a complex and dynamic..." add a verb
page 8, 21 Never the less, - usually one word
The INTRO should be tightened.

The article MUST explain to the reader at the very beginning the ethos of IC in the Arab world. What can it mean? is it different than the Western world? in what ways? laws? litigation? The readers know about the Western precedents - they know very little about the writers' world....
Better writing of the data section is needed.

Discussion:
"The main aim of this study was to obtain empirical data on patients’ norm perception of the purpose of clinical informed consent" please add "in SA..."

NO discussion on the biases of the study. For example - 56% with college education? impressive... yet in page 24-25 you discuss the level of literacy and show that 36% have below basic literacy abilities... you make notice of this in page 29, but I feel it is not enough..

Page 21 Just as secular Western societies continue to be influenced by Judo-Christian norms concerning social ethics [33], Arabic and Islamic societies are still influenced by Islamic social ethics which shares many foundational values with Judaism and Christianity [34]" Unclear to me... please explain/elaborate.
page 21-23 - important discussion, but should be much sorter. Instead - tell us how these religious teaching influenced the law of SA? litigation? or the practice of Physicians? Does the SA medical association have a code of ethics which relates to IC? that would be informative.

The ref list is not up-do-date. New articles in the last years discuss new ways to convey information to patients using IT

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

**Statistical review:** Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests'