Reviewer’s report

Title: To Evaluate the Effectiveness of Health Care Ethics Consultation Based on the Goals of Health Care Ethics Consultation: A Prospective Cohort Study with Randomization

Version: 1 Date: 4 October 2013

Reviewer: Zaher Fanari

Reviewer’s report:

The article answers an important question about the role of ethics committees in a different cultural/social setting when compared to the western culture where the concept of ethics committee was originally adopted.

However, there are few clarifications that can make it even more helpful in guiding patients' care. First, although it is important to report the role of ethics committees in achieving consensus among medical personnel; that does not show the impact of involving this committee on the patient and patients' families in resolving any discrepancy in understanding medical and moral choices and decisions. This impact, which is expected to make a difference with medical personnel by virtue of prior understanding of the role of this committee, may not be true for families.

Second, a more detailed clarification on the measures taken by the usual care group is needed especially reporting any differences in the measures used in areas of clarification of goals of care and achieving agreement between family parties between (HCEC group) and (UC group can be helpful).

Finally, although cost is not a goal of HCEC, the fact that we are reporting a difference in health resources utilization make reporting a difference of cost that may be directed towards other health services pertinent.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

No conflict of interest.