Reviewer's report

Title: How is organ transplantation depicted in internal medicine and transplantation journals?

Version: 1 Date: 12 April 2013

Reviewer: Miran Epstein

Reviewer's report:

This is an important and timely paper. It shows that the representations of transplant medicine have not changed over the past 20 years and remain generally positive.

The authors seem to regard this outcome as problematic assuming that it reflects the same over-idealisation that was so well described by Fox and Swazey in 1992.

While this may be the case (I personally believe that it is indeed the case), the authors do not show that the current positive representation indeed reflects over-idealisation. In principle, things may have changed (or not) for the better.

I believe they should support their view that they haven't.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

Non declared