Reviewer's report

Title: The need for national medical licensing examination in Saudi Arabia

Version: 1 Date: 21 August 2008

Reviewer: W. Dale D. Dauphinee

Reviewer's report:

Reviewer's report: Comments to the authors for BMC medical education submission entitled: The need for national medical licensing examination in Saudi Arabia

Type of article: debate

1. Comments for the editor and to be shared with the authors:
   i. This is an extremely well written and clear article that presents a novel set of arguments for an innovation physician licensure examination in Saudi Arabia based on cutting edge approaches and backed by citation for several relevant international experiences.
   ii. It would of broad interest to any scientist involved in medical education. It is well argued, well organized and well referenced.
   iii. The arguments are comprehensive and use principles and frameworks in keeping with best practices in this field.
   iv. I have surprisingly little to add to a job well done. I enjoyed it and thought that their points of view were fair and they considered both advantages and disadvantages - with logical and valid counter arguments on the possible points of resistance by those who might be opposed. In particular, it was easy to read and the reasoning was very clear and flowed logically.
   v. My one possible recommendation would be to consider one revision. My reason is that is that any licensing examination needs an accompanying legal framework and structure through which the process can be administered and executed and from a candidate's point of view, challenged in the case of an appeal. It is implied by the authors' references to the GMC in the UK or the USMLE in the USA or the MCC in Canada. It would assist naïve readers and non-professionals if this point were made explicitly.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests and including no financial conflicts