Reviewer's report

**Title:** International Medical Graduates (IMGs) Needs Assessment Study: Comparison Between Current IMG Trainees and Program Directors

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 8 December 2007

**Reviewer:** Milton Kramer

**Reviewer's report:**

Major Revisions: 1) Abstract: Describe what you mean by a horizontal curriculum. 2) Introduction: Rewrite last sentence in parag 1, page 2 into two sentences. The same for the first sentence of parag 2, page 2. Methods: On page 3, parag 1, first sentence there is a need to make clear what the needs assessment was directed at and what are the current requirements of IMGs. Explain that U of T has many training sites each with its own residents and training directors. Again, a horizontal curriculum? Why were the groups compared and why use a Mann-Whitney. Mention the differences in the discussion and that the highest scores were chosen to reflect the two groups concerns. Results: Again horizontal curriculum. Table 1. Title importance of aspects of clinical training by etc. Need to have explained why chose these areas and why a comparison and at least the p values. Discussion: The study does not show a belief in the need for a horizontal etc., rather the needs, importance, could be dealt with in this manner. Conclusion: study suggests, not shows, the potential usefulness etc. Lower score and differences doesn't mean not to deal with topic.

**What next?:** Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests.

**Quality of written English:** Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited.

**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I have no competing interests.