Reviewer’s report

Title: Consultant Medical Trainers, Modernising Medical Careers (MMC) and the European Time Directive (EWTD): Tensions and Challenges in a Changing Medical Education Context.

Version: 1 Date: 3 December 2007

Reviewer: Michael Bannon

Reviewer’s report:

The subject area is without doubt important and highly topical. In addition the methodology in principle is suitable for the subject area

However, the usefulness of the paper is severely reduced because

1. The subjects were interviewed in 2005; a lot has happened in postgraduate medical education since then, particularly during the summer of this year
2. The findings are hardly surprising and would be confirmed by anyone involved in postgraduate medical education
3. It could be argued that there was a degree of bias with respect to the sample selection as it included consultants who had elected to attend a training course
4. Little or no mention is made of PMETB and its role in medical education which is yet a further challenge for consultant trainers
5. The paper is rather long and might benefit from tabular summary of the main findings
6. The main research question is unclear: was the intention to define the unmet training needs of consultants or to describe the cultural changes that have occurred as a result of MMC & WTD
7. The implications of WTD needed to be better defined

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I ahve supervised a DH funded project on the implications of WTD on medical
training