Reviewer's report

Title: Curriculum development: how important are medical students' opinions?

Version: 1 Date: 15 January 2008

Reviewer: David Taylor

Reviewer's report:

Reviewer's report

This is an interesting paper, which discusses a questionnaire study administered to single cohorts of fourth and fifth year medical student. The authors are right to emphasise their principle finding which is that curriculum developers need to balance the students own perceived needs with the fundamental knowledge base and principles that experts feel are essential to their speciality.

Discretionary Revisions

My main reservation is that the results are derived over only one academic year, which may, or may not have been atypical. The main conclusions are only valid if the programme of study experienced by the fourth year cohort was equivalent to the previous experience of the fifth year cohort.

The full answer would require additional studies, but the authors might address the possibility that the views of the fifth year cohort reflect the views of their specialist trainers, rather than their own views.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests