Reviewer's report

Title: Loss of International Medical Experiences: Knowledge, Skills, and Attitudes at Risk

Version: 2 Date: 29 May 2007

Reviewer: John B Walden

Reviewer's report:

1. No. The insights, while admirable, are not novel.

2. Yes, the article addresses an important issue of interest to a broad biomedical audience.

3. The piece is not particularly well argued because of annoying distractions caused by disconnectedness (see #5 below) and poor melding of the elements of specific themes. Editing can correct these defects.

4. The arguments are mostly from the heart and not distinctly logical. But, that is not necessarily a fault.

5. No. While all the sentiments expressed by the author are worth conveying, the piece would benefit from editing by a friendly colleague experienced in the subtleties of writing for publication. The author jumps from point to point. Editorial assistance will help maintain a logical and pleasing flow. There are odd comments like this: "Since my first trip abroad at the age of two with Milk for Bangladesh, I have always had an interest in international health." Really? Now, there's one goal-oriented two year old! The author states: "Despite the great impact international medical electives can have on physicians and those they serve, they are decreasing in availability due to the nature of graduate medical education funding." I'm not sure how accurate this statement is. At our institution we are able to offer overseas electives in 34 countries around the world. If anything, there are more elective opportunities now than at any time I can recall in the past 25 years.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions