Reviewer’s report

Title: Who Wants to be a Surgeon? A study of 300 first year medical students

Version: 5 Date: 8 January 2007

Reviewer: Michael J Goldacre

Reviewer’s report:

General

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Please check references - I haven't done a systematic check but have spotted a couple of errors. Firstly, the opening sentence refers to reference 22, but the authors probably mean 21 (there is no 22). Secondly, reference 10 gives “student’s” in the singular. The original, as expected, is plural. Sorry to be fussy!

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests