Reviewer's report

Title: Humanities for medical students? A qualitative study of a medical humanities curriculum in a medical school program.

Version: 2 Date: 10 February 2006

Reviewer: Jane Macnaughton

Reviewer's report:

General
The paper is improved in this second draft, particularly from the point of view of contextualisation. There is also more acknowledgement that the course studied was explicitly set up to allow the power and influence to be mainly medical. It is not clear to me that the authors would acknowledge that if the course involved medical students being placed within humanities courses and faculties that the power base would be from the humanities and that the medical students would be, in turn, considered inferior. This has been the experience of those of us who have experienced courses set up in this way. This is a further ripe seam for further research.

I am still of the view that the paper does not really achieve what it claims to achieve - but it has been improved in this second draft and if the second reviewer is in favour I am happy that it be published.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
The authors may wish to reflect upon my general comment - if they believe it to be true!

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.