Reviewer's report

Title: The attractions of medicine: the generic motivations of medical school applicants in relation to demography, personality and achievement

Version: 2 Date: 10 January 2006

Reviewer: Deborah Saltman

Reviewer's report:

General
This paper is essentially unchanged, however, much more suitable for a medical education audience.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
Two reviewers have commented on the lack of evidence about the construction and validity of the Medical Situations Questionnaire. The authors have not answered these queries nor provided evidence beyond concordance data about the robustness of the instrument.

Particular local idiosyncrasies should be highlighted for an International audience, for example, the ethnic categories: are they a recognised way for ethnicity to be described in the UK?

Also, since the rational for the study is to explore motivations and not link them to outcomes such as enrolments, the authors need to make a statement about how such a study can contribute to knowledge in the area.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'