Author's response to reviews

Title: Exposure to the field of renal transplantation during undergraduate medical education in the UK

Authors:

Anusha G Edwards (dr_ag_edwards@yahoo.com)
Alex Newman (mowglibov@hotmail.com)
Justin D Morgan (justin.morgan@north-bristol.swest.nhs.uk)

Version: 2 Date: 31 August 2005

Dear Editors

We would like to resubmit our work on "Exposure to the field of renal transplantation during undergraduate medical education in the UK" which has been altered in accordance with the reviewers comments. Below, please find a point by point response to each comment and details of how and where the manuscript has been updated:

Giorgina B Piccoli

Regarding the major revisions:
1. We were unable to locate any direct evidence regarding exposure to transplantation and following a career in the speciality. However, previous work with trainees stated lack of exposure as a reason to not become a transplant surgeon. We have commented upon this in the first paragraph of the discussion.
2. Whilst it would be of interest to comment upon the situation in recruitment in nephrology and heart and liver transplantation no such data could be found.

Regarding the minor revisions:
1. Tables 2 and 3 have not been removed as to do so would make the results section very verbose. In their current format the tables make viewing of the data very easy. However, if this were a problem we would not object to removing them and summarising the data in the results section.
2. The discussion has not been shortened, indeed it has been lengthened due to the comments of the second reviewer.
3. In the background the first sentence now reads "Renal transplantation is the first choice treatment for many patients with end-stage renal failure" rather than "for most patients".

Keith Rigg

Regarding the minor revisions:
1. The title "year" has been inserted into the table in figure 1
2. The duplication of ref 7 has been amended.
3. The authors' own views of how to improve exposure have been included in the closing paragraph of the discussion.

Regarding the discretionary revisions:
1. The recommended expansion to the sentence regarding MMC has been done.

We hope that these revisions are satisfactory and look forward to hearing from you soon regarding publication of our work.

Yours faithfully

Anusha Edwards, Alex Newman and Justin Morgan