Reviewer's report

Title: Diversification of U.S. Medical Schools via Affirmative Action Implementation

Authors:

Shaheen E Lakhan (slakhan@fas.harvard.edu)

Version: 1 Date: 7 Jul 2003

Reviewer: Janine C Edwards

Level of interest: A paper of considerable general medical or scientific interest

Advice on publication: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the compulsory revisions

Comments:

1. This manuscript is worth publishing even though the U.S. Supreme Court has announced its decision to continue Affirmative Action program under specified conditions. This manuscript is worthwhile because it can be recast to explain the important arguments why affirmative action is important for medical school admission.

Compulsory Revisions:

2. Recast the article as an explanation of the arguments why the Supreme Court decision is important for medical school admission. These arguments, as stated in the original manuscript, include the following:

   future workforce
   minimizes medical disparities for minority people
   biomedical research
   minority patient satisfaction
   value of medical school classroom diversity

3. Correct the word processing and typographical errors

Discretionary Comments:

3. Pp.5 - 8 are obviated by the Supreme Court decision, in my opinion. Furthermore, this material is not as compelling as the arguments listed above. My suggestion is to delete this material.

Competing interests:

None declared.