Reviewer's report

Title: Mind-Body Skills Groups for Medical Students

Version: 2  Date: 25 March 2014

Reviewer: Amy Tan

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revision:
Very interesting topic and a relevant topic for medical education. However, I believe that there needs to be more clarity as to the type of paper this is so that it can be reviewed accordingly and appropriately. It is categorized as a debate, yet there are elements within the paper that this was actually a research project/survey. Is this meant to be a program description of what the medical schools are doing, a critical appraisal of the different programs identified, or is it meant to be a research project using a survey as the primary methodology for program evaluation of those schools who had attended the MBSG Faculty Development and then went on to implement this training at their home schools? It is written with Methods, Results and Discussion (though there is an "extra" Discussion session during the Background which introduces the MBSG training program as well). This would lead one to think it was a research project and if so, issues such as ethics approval and method of data analysis would need to be described in the manuscript. The last part of the "results" section, which summarizes what is done at all but 2 schools, contains thematic analysis of benefits and challenges, but this is not clear in the methodology if this was the intent and if so, how it was designed. If it is meant to be a debate, then I think the organization of the paper may need to be reworked to be framed as an argument with reasoning. As written, I feel that it is somewhere in between, but unclear as to what the intended goal of the paper was to be written as.

Until this is clarified, I find it difficult to make further comments on other revisions.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests' below.