Reviewer's report

Title: Student centered curricular elements are associated with healthier educational environment and lower depressive symptoms in medical students

Version: 2 Date: 5 November 2013

Reviewer: Muhamad Saiful Bahri Yusoff

Reviewer's report:

Introduction:

It was reported that at least 12% of medical students have severe depression on the Beck Depression Inventory (BDI) at three measuring points during their first three years compared with a rate of 3% to 4% observed among the general population. 10,11 - reference no 10 and 11 are quite old, 1978 and 1988 respectively. Perhaps the authors should cite more recent evidence on this topic for e.g. an article entitled "The impact of medical education on psychological health of students: A cohort study" published in 2013 by Psychology Health & Medicine reported similar finding.

Other than that acceptable.

Method:

How do authors determine sample size? What sampling method used? It seems that one group had double number that other (as reported in table 1).

Results were apprpriately presented

Discussion:

Another recent study entitled "Mental health of medical students before and during medical education: A prospective study.", done in system-based curriculum, found males are more depressed than female. Perhaps this could support the result found.

Overall clear

Conclusion presented key findings which is appropriate.

References: some are quite old and adding recent relevant articles should enrich this article further.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests: I declare that I have no competing interests