Reviewer's report

Title: Formation of medical student professional identity: categorizing lapses of professionalism, and the learning environment.

Version: 1 Date: 2 April 2014

Reviewer: Fred C.J Stevens

Reviewer's report:

This paper reports the results of a study among medical students on lapses in professionalism. A survey was done in one medical school with a reported response rate of 45.6 percent. The authors report a lapse of professionalism in different domains and emphasize the importance of role modelling and faculty development. The paper is not without merit but the problematic aspects of the study are too extensive to recommend revision or publication:

- The data themselves are of interest, but the analysis at this point does relatively little with these beyond providing some basic descriptive information.
- There are several methodological issues that should have been addressed, such as the low response rate and how this relates to the characteristics of the study population in the different years.
- The study informs practice but it is unclear how the study adds to knowledge beyond the local context. The study would have benefited from the inclusion of more medical schools.
- Some of the issues raised are of interest, the points made are good, but could have been made with less words in the introduction and body of the article and less discussion overall.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests