Reviewer's report

Title: Formation of medical student professional identity: categorizing lapses of professionalism, and the learning environment.

Version: 1 Date: 10 March 2014

Reviewer: Marc Soethout

Reviewer's report:

I have read the manuscript titled "formation of medical student professional identity: categorizing lapses of professionalism, and the learning environment" with great interest. I agree with the authors that acquiring the values of medical professionalism is a main and important issue in medical education. This study gives some insight in the way students are involved with professionalism values during their medical course. But it also shows that we still have a long way to go.

I have some remarks for improvement of this manuscript. The main important remark is that the manuscript is much too long with almost 5000 words. The introduction and especially the discussion are too long and should be more restricted to the main goal of this study.

The objectives of the study are clear. However the problem of professionalism and the way students are confronted with this might be described in a shorter way.

The survey was already done in 2006. What has changed in the mean period? Or is it possible to make a comparison with later results?

The response rate is not clear to me: what do the authors mean by a possible 559? Are there gender differences, and what about the non-responders?

The results show many percentages and different categories divided in pre-clinical and clinical responders. I suggest to describe only the main differences between pre-clinical and clinical responders and combine figure 2 and figuring 3.

The discussion is too long especially the second part of it. The low response needed some more explanation: what is the influence of the low third year response on the results?

Table 4 should be a part of the results and only discussed in the discussion paragraph.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.