Reviewer's report

Title: Senior medical student perceived ability and experience in giving peer feedback in formative long case examinations.

Version: 1 Date: 31 March 2013

Reviewer: Clinton Mitchell

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions:
None.

Minor essential revisions:
Reference 9 in paragraph 3 needs to be changed to publication standard.

Discretionary revisions:
I would appreciate more discussion of why Pendelton’s positive critique method was chosen as the method of teaching feedback. Bennett (2012) [Framework for feedback: the peer mini-clinical examination as a formative assessment tool] has recently discussed the use of the mini-CEX as a framework for feedback. A mini-CEX is probably not the most appropriate tool for a traditional long case (but it's use is becoming more widespread in Australian training programs and a brief comment may be appropriate).

I am not sure the final paragraph of the results section adds anything of value to the paper as a whole, and I suspect the fact that only 17% feel this way is given too much weight in the discussion section (and in fact may be too "rose-tinted"). I would suggest removing this from the paper.

Address where the authors intend to take this study. Would they include more quantitative data capture on future iterations?

General comments:
A well written paper with interesting results and conclusions (especially around the high level of students feeling that they were adequately trained to give feedback). It would be interesting to note if any data is available on the examinee’s response to peer feedback (e.g., how do these same students feel when the shoe is on the other foot?) besides the comments about how seeing deficits in others made them more aware of their own etc..

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable
**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.