Reviewer’s report

Title: Fostering Autonomous Motivation: Implications of Self-Determination Theory for Teachers and Leaders in Academic Medicine

Version: 1 Date: 6 June 2013

Reviewer: Janke Cohen-Schotanus

Reviewer's report:


The authors of this well written manuscript discuss motivational research and self-determination theory to inspire academic faculty leaders and medical educators to apply these principles in practice.

Major compulsory revisions

I read the article with pleasure and the overview of the self-determination theory was clearly described. The authors also gave examples of possibilities to apply the theory in practice. On one side I found that informative, on the other side, the examples were rather local. I miss a broader view on medical education. I wondered, when applying SDT, what the difference is between traditional lecture-based curricula and problem based programmes. Does PBL”score” higher on SDT and in which domains? Are the authors in favour of implementation of PBL? In my opinion, adding such an analysis/exploration/discussion to the manuscript would improve the relevance of the article for readers of BMC medical education.

In medical education literature the topic motivation in relation to self-determination theory is discussed before. In 2011 Kusarkar et al (Medical Teacher) published a literature review about motivation: Motivation as an dependent and an independent variable in medical education. They also related their outcome to SDT. I miss a referral to this paper. I also would appreciate if the authors discuss the outcome of this paper (is motivation a dependent or an independent variable) in relation to their examples. In general, the authors do hardly refer to medical education literature. What does applying SDT mean for the problems discussed in recent medical education literature? In other words, what does this article add to what we know already?

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.