Reviewer's report

Title: Remediation of At-Risk Medical Students: Theory in Action

Version: 2 Date: 15 July 2013

Reviewer: Jennifer Cleland

Reviewer's report:

I really enjoyed reading this article. It is thoughtful, well-balanced, clear and a little bit different from the usual medical education offerings, which makes it very stimulating.

My comments are minor. The introductory paragraph in the Background might be strengthened by including reference to a recent systematic review - Cleland et al., Medical Education 2013, which identified that remediation is not effective. This provides more reason for this type of paper which tries to tease out what actually might make a difference.

The examplars are excellent.

The author's reflexive stance is clearly stated, and language of the article generally suitably prudent given it is a small, indepth study from one institution.

The parallels with teacher education and teaching practice are striking, and emphasises the need for medical education to draw more from education (this could possibly be encompassed near the end of the discussion - but not essential).

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'