Reviewer's report

Title: Indian medical students in public and private sector medical schools: are motivations and career aspirations different? - Studies from Madhya Pradesh, India

Version: 2 Date: 14 June 2013

Reviewer: Shivaswamy S M.S.

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions - NIL

Minor Essential Revisions - NIL

Discretionary Revisions
1. What is the admission procedure for government quota students in private colleges for out of state students?
2. Is there any compulsory rural health service now existing in the state after completion of internship? Any legal bond is taken from the student? If they do not undergo compulsory rural service, what is the penalty imposed by the state?
3. No explicit mention about written informed consent by study participants?
4. No follow up effort to for those who missed on the day of the survey in their institutions?
5. Whether the survey was conducted simultaneously in all the institutions?
6. Mention the average time gap between student's admission & time of the survey?
7. Data could have been collected about how many had one/ both parents as doctors? This can also influence their selection in medical college / rural service.
8. How many students were from All India Quota / CBSE in Govt. medical colleges?
9. Any difference between General merit / reserved category admission students?
10. Reference not quoted for recent changes in migration rules of foreign countries.
11. Students could have been asked in the questionnaire about under which quota they were admitted in private medical colleges, if data was not available with college.
12. A follow up study may be planned after five years for the same batch of students in the same institutions (during internship /after graduation) to see whether their preference for Rural service / pursuing PG study / Going abroad has changed.
Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests in relation to this paper.