Reviewer’s report

Title: Characteristic profiles among students and junior doctors with specific career preferences

Version: 1 Date: 18 March 2013

Reviewer: Michael J Goldacre

Reviewer’s report:

Discretionary revisions

1. This is a sound paper on an interesting and important topic. It is good to see a paper on this from outside the USA or UK. On a smallish point, however, in the Introduction, page 3, last full paragraph, the authors claim that, outside the USA, studies are limited in focus such as dealing with ‘medical graduates who have already chosen their specialties’, and that ‘there are no studies done at a national level’. I think that it is a bit misleading to class the publications from the UK Medical Careers Group in this way. It has published extensively on foundation year doctors (who have not fully chosen their careers but have expressed career preferences for different specialties), has reported on factors that have influenced career choice for particular specialties, and its publications are all national (all UK) – see list of relevant publications at the bottom of this review. The authors don’t need to list them but, in my view, they should acknowledge that there is a large literature on national studies of career preferences for individual specialties from the UK.


Goldacre MJ, Laxton L, Harrison EM, Richards JMJ, Lambert TW, Parks RW.
2. I have a couple of points on presentation.
The Legends to the Tables – the text after the first line is presumably intended to be published as a footnote. For some readers, the content of the tables will be unfamiliar, and in a slightly extended footnote I think it would be good to add a sentence to specify what the data in the table mean and how they should be interpreted. Then each Table would ‘stand alone’ in being meaningful without searching for any other information.

Otherwise, nice paper and no further comments.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests