Reviewer's report

Title: Family Medicine Graduates' Perceptions of Intimidation, Harassment, and Discrimination during Residency Training

Version: 1 Date: 17 May 2011

Reviewer: Narelle Shadbolt

Reviewer's report:

This is an interesting paper and this is an important area of inquiry. However, the results do seem to cover old ground and would be worthwhile to consider in more detail how this information informs an approach to students and teachers about the impact of IHD and how this could be investigated.

1. Major - the paper looks specifically at students in a family medicine program. Is there an underlying unstated opinion that IHD would be less in such a program. Since the authors note that this is an area that has been well researched, it would be worth stating more clearly the reasons behind this research being conducted and what makes it different or important in this particular group of students and teachers. What new information has resulted

There is important missing information – was this part of a usual exit survey or specifically crafted for this research. What do we know about those who didn’t complete the survey – if they were students who had nothing to report on this issue – then this is a major problem with the results. How did the researchers arrive at the group of descriptors. Did the survey collect free text and how was this analysed. Why is the data so old – some respondents would now be 10 years post graduate – and therefore how can this data be applied now.

2. Discretionary.

Care needs to be taken when using terms which are highly emotive such as ‘abuse’ when describing a range of behaviours which have been grouped under a heading as broad as IHD. A clearer understanding or description of some terms such as ‘work as punishment’ and ‘recrimination for reporting’ – examples of what this means could assist. In the limitations section – it seems that respondents themselves may have widely interpreted the meaning of such terms

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests