Reviewer’s report

Title: Analysing the operative experience of basic surgical trainees in Ireland using a web-based logbook

Version: 1 Date: 4 August 2011

Reviewer: Seiji Yamashiro

Reviewer’s report:

This paper is very interesting for analysis of surgical training experience using by national web-based database. This data is also important for each program to improve or change for surgical trainees in the basic training years. I am strongly agreed with authors who mentioned that the use of surgical simulators will be necessary for trainees to improve their skill up from the result of this paper. I think that this paper deserves to be reported in the BMC medical education.

Major comments: No comment.

Minor comments:
- Figure 1 and 2 are very impressive because it is easy for us to understand the rate of assisted or performed experience at a glance.
- I want to know about the result of the experience for other surgical specialties beside general surgery and orthopedics during basic surgical training.
- Authors said that under-reporting or inappropriate reporting might be challenging in this data. In addition, it is more important to check each trainee’s quality of procedure skill.