Reviewer's report

**Title:** Is different better? Models of teaching and their influence on the net financial outcome for general practice teaching posts

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 13 May 2011

**Reviewer:** Amenuve Bekui

**Reviewer's report:**

The authors address the question of net financial outcomes of various clearly defined teaching models that are stated to be present or easily adapted to the situation of general practitioner teaching practices in South Australia.

They base their cost data on prior work by Laurence C et al (Med J Aust 2010:193:608-613) that was gathered from the same South Australia general practitioner setting for undergraduate medical student training, adapting costs to each model.

The paper is well written with interpretations and conclusions based on presented data, and the limitations (cost based on undergraduate medical student placements; the regional nature of costs; uniform space requirements, etc) are clearly stated.

**Major Compulsory Revisions**

None

**Minor Essential Revisions**

None

**Discretionary Revisions:**

1. Because their focus is the net financial cost to the teaching practice, they did not address the question of whether the end-product of the trainees is the same under the different teaching models. It would be useful if in their discussion section a comment is made on this issue (discretionary revision).

2. Net financial outcome for the models in table 4 is presented as per week, but in table 5 (GP Teacher Model) it is presented as per week with an annual remuneration summary. For consistency suggest similar annual remuneration summary for models 1 – 3 if the duration of trainee length of placement per annum is known.

3. In the abstract, consider including the loss reduction number (with CI) for Model 2 as was done for the other models (abstract results paragraph line 3).

**Minor issues not for publication:**

1. Line 4 paragraph 1 of Background: use a small “u” instead of a capital “U” at
start of universities.

2. Line 4 paragraph 1 of Teaching models under Methods section: suggest place AOGP in parenthesis after “Adelaide to Outback GP Training Program” as this abbreviation does appear in the last but one sentence under cost parameters in the Methods section.

3. The last sentence under Teaching Models of the Methods section: place periods after the i and the e in ie – i.e.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.