Reviewer's report

Title: Discrimination against International Medical Graduates in the U.S. Residency Program Selection Process

Version: 2 Date: 1 August 2009

Reviewer: Amy Hagopian

Reviewer's report:

This paper is a polemic attack on residency program "discrimination" against international medical graduates. Data consist of a review of findings from three published papers in the literature, dated 1994, 1997 and 2002. The conclusion is that residency programs preferentially admit USMGs over IMGs, and that this is unfortunate because it undermines the value of meritocracy. Authors do admit "IMGs impose an extra educational burden on US residency programs, especially in the first year of residency," but dismiss this concern with the statement that while "knowledge deficits are not trivial and take real resources in the form of special and curriculum and faculty time to resolve," these problems "can be expunged."

There is no acknowledgment whatsoever of a growing concern about depleting the physician workforce in countries of origin (about 60% of IMGs in the US come from low or lower-middle income countries).

Methods are trivial, findings are irrational, and conclusions are not helpful to the discussion. Reject.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.