Reviewer’s report

Title: CD 9 and vimentin distinguish clear cell from chromophobe renal cell carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 6 May 2009

Reviewer: Holger Moch Moch

Reviewer’s report:

In this manuscript, the authors used the results of their previous gene expression profiles to identify candidate markers that may aid in differentiating clear cell RCC from chromophobe RCC. They used about 40 antisera and antibodies for this attempt. At the end of this great effort, only 7 markers were scored on a tissue microarray. Finally, only Vimentin and CD9 were able to distinguish clear cell RCC from chromophobe RCC.

Minor Essential Revisions
Page 7: According to the current WHO classification, granular cell carcinoma and sarkomatoid renal cell carcinoma are not an own tumor entity. papillary renal epithelia neoplasm. Please specify.
Page 8: the authors mention 2 poorly differentiated carcinomas, which could not be further histologically characterized. This group should be expanded with the other tumors as a group of renal cancer, unclassified.
Discussion: The expression of CD9 and vimentin in oncocytoma should be discussed in a separate para of the discussion.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.