Reviewer's report

Title: Protection of Early Phase Hepatic Ischemia-Reperfusion Injury by Cholinergic Agonists

Version: 2 Date: 3 January 2006

Reviewer: Ian Hines

Reviewer's report:

General

The article entitled "Protection of Early Phase Hepatic Ischemia-Reperfusion Injury by Cholinergic Agonists" by Crockett is well written and the conclusions drawn are supported by the data presented. The manuscript has been revised to include the potential effects of cholinergic agonists on hepatic blood flow and endothelial cell function.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

The text within the figure demonstrating the immunohistochemical localization of neutrophils should include the duration of reperfusion.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

It is strongly suggested that the real-time PCR data be quantified using the comparative cT method as this method of gene expression is quantitative and far superior to end-point analysis. It is further recommended that this data be displayed in graphical format (bar graph) instead of amplification plots for simplicity of reading.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests