Reviewer's report

Title: Inclusion of MUC1 (Ma695) in a panel of immunohistochemical markers is useful for distinguishing between endocervical and endometrial mucinous adenocarcinoma.

Version: 1 Date: 26 August 2005

Reviewer: Jeffrey D. Seidman

Reviewer's report:

General

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)none

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
The statistical tests for each immunohistochemical marker are useful. However, of more practical use to the pathologist is the entire panel as a unit. It would therefore be of value to list the results of the panel tested in the varying combinations and report the associated predictive value of the results. For example, a vimentin +, ER+, etc result might support an endometrial origin in 80% of cases. This information could be provided in an additional table. It is not necessary to include all possible combinations of results- only the most useful ones.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)none

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.