Reviewer’s report

Title: Implant Based Differences in Adverse Local Tissue Reaction in Failed Total Hip Arthroplasties: A Morphological and Immunohistochemical Study

Version: 2 Date: 27 August 2014

Reviewer: Jiri Gallo

Reviewer’s report:

Minor Essential Revision
I am happy with the changes performed on the manuscript.

1) I would recommend to diminish the strong statements about the novelty of ALTR as “a newly identified failure mode of THA”. This mode of failure is old, it is known for a long time, from the first studies of Willert and co-workers to Konttinen’s and Goodman’s studies (and several others). I mean the foreign body response in terms of findings of mixed inflammatory cell infiltrate, extensive soft-tissue necrosis, and vascular/ perivascular changes. Of course, the novelty is clear and lies in approach, details, rules, overall interpretation strategy … great, but I strongly recommend respecting the contribution of other researchers. Therefore, it would be better to build the story on the history and what is known to date. The authors can involve the review published recently in Acta Biomater (Gallo et al, 2014), which calls for further progress in the field especially in terms of reducing the heterogeneity related to implant characteristics (incl. innovations) etc.

2) Citation 27: correctly should be 1977 instead of 1997.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'