Author’s response to reviews

Title: P53 nuclear stabilization is associated with FHIT loss and younger age of onset in squamous cell carcinoma of oral tongue

Authors:

Raju SR Adduri (sraju@cdfd.org.in)
Viswakalyan KOTAPALLI (kalyan@cdfd.org.in)
Neha A Gupta (guptaneha18@gmail.com)
Swarnalata Gowrishankar (swarnalatag@gmail.com)
Mukta Srinivasulu (muktasrinivasulu@yahoo.co.in)
Mohammed M Ali (cuttosave@gmail.com)
Subramanyeshwar Rao (subramanyesh@gmail.com)
Shantveer G Uppin (drguppin@yahoo.co.in)
Umanath K Nayak (drumanathnayak@gmail.com)
Snehalatha Dhagam (doctorsneha@rediffmail.com)
Mohana V Chigurupati (drmohanavamsy@gmail.com)
Murali D Bashyam (bashyam@cdfd.org.in)

Version: 2 Date: 17 July 2014

Author’s response to reviews: see over
July 17, 2014

Magdalena Morawska
Executive Editor
BMC Clinical Pathology

Sub: Submission of revised manuscript to BMC Clinical Pathology

Dear Dr. Morawska,

Thank you for reviewing our manuscript titled "P53 nuclear stabilization is associated with FHIT loss and younger age of onset in squamous cell carcinoma of oral tongue" and for forwarding insightful comments of the reviewers. We have now revised the manuscript based on queries/concerns raised by the reviewers. As per your request, I have attached a point by point response to reviewer’s comments. We hope that you will now find the manuscript acceptable for publication in your esteemed journal.

Thanking you,
Sincerely yours,

Murali Dharan Bashyam, PhD, MNAScI
Staff Scientist and Chief,
Laboratory of Molecular Oncology,
Centre for DNA Fingerprinting and Diagnostics (CDFD),
Tuljaguda complex, Nampally,
Hyderabad 500001, INDIA
Ph: 91-40-24749383
Fax: 91-40-24749448
E-mail: bashyam@cdfd.org.in
Response to reviewer’s comments

Reviewer: Joel Schwartz

Comment 1:

A statement that the IHC results may or may not be representative of the whole specimen as there is no method provided that distinguished site of selection of specimen material in relationship to growth border of the tumor mass.

Response: We are thankful to the reviewer for this comment. It is true that the slice of tissue which was used for IHC may not be representative of whole tumor, though this is the standard practice across the world. However, we have included a statement in the materials and methods sections of the revised manuscript, mentioning this fact.

Comment 2: A statement that significance to result is presence of limited numbers of cases that are under review. Moreover, this study does provide a systematic approach to determine important molecular indices that reflect selective influence upon epithelial clones and possible clinical outcome.

Response: We appreciate the suggestion made by the reviewer. It is true that the study was conducted on a smaller size of samples. However, this study may help in selecting molecular markers for larger studies that may have clinical significance, as rightly pointed out by the reviewer. The same is now mentioned in the conclusions sections of the revised manuscript.

Comment 3: In addition statement of epidemiological variables present in this population and a statistical correlation to molecular results would be helpful to arrive at a better risk determination.

Response: We are grateful to the reviewer for this comment. However, the objective of the study was not to determine effect of various epidemiological and molecular factors on risk of tongue cancer. Therefore, we feel including such a statement will dilute the focus of the study and may actually be incorrect. Hence, we have not made changes in the manuscript to include this point.

Reviewer: Hiroyuki Mineta

Comment 1: The author can be trusted to make these. For example, missing labels on figures, the wrong use of a term, spelling mistakes.

Response: We are grateful to the reviewer for critical evaluation of the manuscript and for pointing out errors. We have corrected the errors in the revised manuscript.

All changes in the revised manuscript are underlined. Based on the clarifications presented above, we hope that the revised manuscript may kindly be accepted for publication.