Reviewer's report

Title: EphA4 is a prognostic factor in gastric cancer

Version: 2 Date: 1 March 2013

Reviewer: Woo Ho Kim

Reviewer's report:

First of all, the data in the text, figures and tables do not match.

(1) In the ABSTRACT, they described as "In stage II and III cancer, EphA4 and EphA2 were both significantly associated with shorter survival (p=0.007 and 0.020), but only EphA2 was an independent prognostic factor (HR, 2.5; 95% CI, 1.0-6.2; p=0.042)." In the table 5, the p values and HR are different.

(2) In table 4, number of patients with low and high EphA2 is 92 and 60, respectively. It is different from the Table 3 or Figure 2A

(3) The label ("figure 1") in the photograph of IHC is described as "A:" in the figure legends.

(4) The reliability of the immunohistochemistry result is heavily depend upon the quality of the antibody. The authors are using commercial polyclonal antibodies, but the reliability of those antibodies have not tested. This might be related to the discrepant expression between primary and metastatic lesions.

(5) The results should be verified with mRNA or western blot data for the readers to convince the result.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interest.