Reviewer's report

Title: New serum DNA isolation strategy enables simultaneous analyses of circulating tumor DNA and serum-autantibody testing

Version: 3 Date: 3 June 2011

Reviewer: Ugur Deligezer

Reviewer's report:

In this study Wielscher M et al describe simultaneous DNA extraction and protein analysis from same serum/plasma samples by using the methyl-binding protein (MBD). The novelty and scientific value of presented data is low, and the manuscript is not written well. Not enoughly pointed out in the manuscript, one of the main limitations of using MBD is that DNA extracted from serum/plasma is applicable in only methylation assays.

Major Compulsory Revisions:
1. All sections of the manuscript (Introduction, Methods, Results, and Discussion) are too long and should be condensed. Especially, the Results and Discussion sections are not written clear and concise. In addition, there are too many typing errors through the text.
2. A subsection in Methods describing statistical tests used should be added.
3. Page 12, DNA amounts in sera of BC patients: in this subsection I was unable to get through as the authors used different number of samples for the silica-membrane and MBD comparison and it is confused.
4. It is not clear how the authors performed the methylation analysis.
5. I believe that in respect to aim of the study the authors included many unnecessary points to the manuscript. Some examples are the comparison of Picogreen measurement and qPCR or looking at the effect of age and gender on DNA concentration extracted.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests