Reviewer’s report

Title: Induction of apoptosis of human primary osteoclasts treated with extracts from the medicinal plant Emblica officinalis

Version: 1 Date: 22 July 2008

Reviewer: Eiji Takeda

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
1) Water extracts of Emblica officinalis are able to induce specifically programmed cell death of matore OCs, without altering the process of osteoclastogenesis. However, Emblica officinalis extracts affect NF-kB activity which is a transcription factor involved in osteoclastogenesis. It seems to be great discrepancy in the experiments.

2) Authors proposed that the pro-apoptotic action of Emblica officinalis extracts on osteoclasts could be mediated, at least in part, by interfering with NF-kB activity. Further experiments are absolutely required to explain this relation.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.