Reviewer's report

Title: Induction of apoptosis of human primary osteoclasts treated with extracts from the medicinal plant Emblica officinalis

Version: 1 Date: 14 July 2008

Reviewer: Gordon S Howarth

Reviewer's report:

This paper is generally well-written and the study is worthwhile. A revision is warranted.

Major Compulsory Revisions
The study has generally been well-conducted and the manuscript well-written. However, with the exception of figure 2, the results are essentially descriptive. There needs to be some form of quantification together with statistical comparisons before the results can be considered to be definitive. Means/SEMs/medians/ranges etc of data are required as the reader only has some photographs to indicate that 'E officinalis specifically increased expression levels of Fas' for example. No data are presented.

Minor Essential Revisions
There are a number of typographical errors and omitted words which will require attention in the revision. Most notably in the title which should read 'Induction of apoptosis in....". There is a tendency to use loose grammar (eg osteoclasts are involved in arthritis) rather than to be more specific regarding the nature of OC 'involvement'.

Discretionary Revisions
Nil

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests