Author's response to reviews

Title: In vivo effects of Pain Relieving Plaster on closed soft tissue injury in rabbit ears

Authors:

yongzhi Wang (wangyongzhi-1978@hotmail.com)
fuhui Dong (fuhuidong@263.net)
honggang Zhong (greatgun_2202@hotmail.com)
chunyu Guo (guochunyu66@sina.com)
delong Wang (wdljoe@hotmail.com)
xuan Wang (cp217@hotmail.com)
wannian Zhang (316aw@sina.com)

Version: 4 Date: 21 February 2008

Author's response to reviews: see over
Revision

Referee 1

1. Quoting reference in the text is in square brackets.
2. The abstract is edited according to the standard of the background.
3. The printed title in page 2 just above the background of the study is deleted.
4. The whole article is formatted according to the style of the journal.
5. Acknowledgements section, competing interest and contribution from each author added in the end of the manuscript.

Referee 2

Major compulsory revision

1. The PRP extract was evaporated to obtain a concentration equivalent to 0.5 g/mL crude drug which is added to the text.
2. Though significant difference was not found within 5 hours, a significant decrease in edema gain happened after two days.
3. Considering unexpected effects that different steps may bring, we use the sham group to observe them. Finally, there were no side-effects and the result in Figure 1 was acceptable. Furthermore, we do the research to study effects of Pain Relieving Plaster on closed soft tissue injury. Thus, farther statistical analysis was not given in the text.

Minor Essential Revisions

All minor essential revisions are made according to the suggestion and the style of the journal.

Referee 3

1. The composition of PRP was added and the rationality was given in the discussion section.
2. The statement approved by the institutional ethics committee was included.
3. With the soft tissue clamp, we pressure the rabbit lobule which causing 6mm×6mm injury. The pressure can be controlled at 21.2kg/cm² by mechanical sensor.

4. The information with reference in favor of PRP for its anti-inflammatory activity is added at the discussion section.

5. Curcuma longa definitely contains alkaloid. We mentioned alkaloid mainly considering other herbs. Some other errors were corrected in the table.

Referee 4
It is a wrong word which has been corrected.

Reviewers' comments

Referee 1
Reviewer's report
Title: In vivo effects of Pain Relieving Plaster on closed soft tissue injury in rabbit ears
Version: 3 Date: 18 January 2008
Reviewer: Shivananda Nayak
Reviewer's report:
Abstract should be prepared according to the standard of the Background
Methods
Results
Conclusions
Quoting the reference in the text should be in bracket [1]
The author has printed title again in page 2 just above the background of the study.
it should be deleted and title should appear only once
The whole article is not formatted according to the style of the journal and therefore it should be formatted as per the author instructions.
Again the reference style is not followed according to the author instructions of the journal. It should be formatted as per the requirement of the journal
acknowledgements section missed. Mention the acknowledgements if there is any
Competeting interest and contribution from each author should be written.
What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions
Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the
statistics.

Referee 2
Reviewer's report
Title: In vivo effects of Pain Relieving Plaster on closed soft tissue injury in rabbit ears
Version: 3 Date: 29 January 2008
Reviewer: Lonchin Suguna
Reviewer's report:
Major compulsory revision
1. Why is the concentration of the PRP not mentioned?
2. It is mentioned in the Results section that there was no significant difference in edema formation between control and PRP groups. But in discussion, it is mentioned that PRP reduces edema formation. Explain.
3. The results of sham control are not shown in Table 2 and Figure 3. Why?
Minor Essential Revisions
1. The names of all the plants should be italicized wherever they appear.
2. In page 2, in abstract, line 2, there should be a space between Pain Relieving Plaster and (PRP)
3. In abstract, in line 3, there should be a space between injury and (CSTI)
4. In page 2, methods, line 10, studied including could be replaced by studied for
5. In page 2, results, line 14, indicated CSTI could be replaced by indicated that CSTI.
6. In page 2, results, line 16, decreased elevated edema could be replaced by decreased the elevated edema level
7. In page 4, line 2, a space should be included between Plaster and (PRP)
8. In page 4, line 3, plateau should be replaced by Plateau and China's should be replaced by China
9. In page 4, line 13, space should be placed between bracteata and (Table 1)
10. In page 4, line 14, in should be removed.
11. In page 4, line 15, was connect should be replaced by was connected
12. In page 4, line 28, of should be added next to UV spectra
13. In page 5, line 11, herbs extracts should be replaced by herbal extracts and NaCL should be replaced by NaCl
14. In page 5, line 7, by applying a soft tissue clamp with - font is different
15. In page 5, line 13, was conducted could be replaced by were conducted
16. In page 5, line 17, ear is should be replaced by was
17. In page 5, line 21, are should be replaced by were
18. In page 7, line 1, font is different
19. In page 7, line 4, founded should be replaced by found
20. In page 7, line 16, result could be replaced by results
21. In page 7, para 4, the sentence significant increasing BFV in short time after injury suggests decreased tissue oxygenation could be rewritten as significant increase in BFV in short time after injury suggests that decreased tissue oxygenation is
22. Table 2, title font is different
23. In page 15, para 4, line 16, BaCL should be replaced by NaCl

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests

Referee 3
Reviewer's report
Title: In vivo effects of Pain Relieving Plaster on closed soft tissue injury in rabbit ears
Version: 3 Date: 30 January 2008
Reviewer: Tuhin Biswas
Reviewer's report:
The research paper entitled above has been reviewed by me and the paper is found to be really very much interesting and promising. It is a new dimension in anti-inflammatory pharmacology of Chinese medicinal plants. However, author may take care of following points for revision of the paper before re-submission for publication:
1. In composition of PRP author did not mention the basic rationality for combination of such medicinal plants. It is better to be mentioned here.
2. It is mandatory in experimental pharmacological research to take necessary ethical permission from Institutional Ethics Committee (IEC). However, authors did not mentioned it clearly. Author may please mention it.
3. Closed soft tissue injury induction was made on rabbit ear lobule in a very sophisticated technical procedure. However, it is not clear that how the pressure of 21.2 kg/cm2 was given on rabbit. Please clarify.
4. In discussion, author has mentioned that Curcuma longa has activity in relation to removal of stasis. Besides, C. longa is also reputed for its anti-inflammatory activity. Please include this information with reference in favour of PRP for its anti-inflammatory activity.
5. Curcumin is a variety of alkaloid. Why then author mentioned Curcumin separately in table 1 inspite of mentioning alkaloid as a component is not clear. Author please justify.

Paper may be accepted after revision.

Referee 4
Reviewer's report
Title: In vivo effects of Pain Relieving Plaster on closed soft tissue injury in rabbit ears
Version: 3 Date: 8 February 2008
Reviewer: maria B witte
Reviewer's report:
The paper investigates the effect of a pain relieving traditional herbal medication on soft tissue injury in a rabbit ear model. The local application for 30 min. of the traditional medicine reduces edema formation after 2 and 3 days as well as redness and area swelling. The effect was unauffected by local temperature. The effect could partially be explained by a reduction in blood velocity shortly after injury.

The paper is well written and statistically adequately analyzed. It investigates traditional herbal medicine that has been used for a long time without ever having been investigated experimentally. Therefore it deserves interest.

Minor concern regarding language (page 7 in the results): the statement "no interaction of time x group difference was founded" is not misunderstandable.

What next?: Accept without revision
Level of interest: An article of limited interest
Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.