Reviewer's report

Title: Kihi-to, a herbal traditional medicine, improves Abeta(25-35)-induced memory impairment and losses of neurites and synapses

Version: 2 Date: 24 June 2008

Reviewer: Raymond Chang

Reviewer's report:

Authors have put effort in improving the quality of the manuscript. However, the explanation of the results is not acceptable unless more concrete results can prove that they are correct.

On one hand, they claim that inhibition of calpain or modulation of calcium may explain the neuroprotective effects Kihi-to. However, Kihi-ho was applied 10 days after in vivo experiments of Abeta injection. One should know that responses of calpain and calcium are fast response. Even though Kihi-to can inhibit calpain, it may be a concomittant effects. There are not correlation to explain this is the reason of neuroprotection. Unless the authors use inhibitor of calpain together with Kihi-to to cancel the effects of Kihi-to.

I do think the problem of this study is on the explanation of your results. It is not concrete and sounded by the current explanation. I would rather accept if you state that Kihi-to has the effects of A, B, C,... Then, it is acceptable in this Journal.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.