Author’s response to reviews

Title: Effect of Fagonia Arabica (Dhamasa) on in vitro thrombolysis

Authors:
Sweta Prasad (sweta_ciims@yahoo.com)
Rajpal S Kashyap (raj_ciims@rediffmail.com)
Jayant Y Deopujari (jy_deopujari@rediffmail.com)
Hemant J Purohit (hemantdrb@rediffmail.com)
Girdhar M Taori (taorigm_ciims@yahoo.co.in)
Hatim F Daginawala (hfd_ciims@yahoo.co.in)

Version: 2 Date: 24 May 2007

Author’s response to reviews:

To,
The Editor,
Journal of complementary and alternative medicine

Sir,
Please find enclosed copy of the revised manuscript entitled Effect of Fagonia Arabica (Dhamasa) on in vitro thrombolysis (MS: 1588256974135811) along with the reply to the reviewer’s comments.

With best regards,

Dr. H.F. Daginawala

Reviewer 1

Roy Hantgan

Major Compulsory Revisions

Q. the authors should reconsider and revise their comments about the side effects of herbal remedies compared to pharmaceuticals

Ans. The comment was reconsidered. The mistake was realized and in absence of peer reviewed articles supporting the comment it was decided to remove it with reference quoted. The correction has been incorporated.

Discretionary Revisions

Q. The authors should present the data in Table 1 to no more than 2 decimal points.

Ans. The correction has been incorporated.

Q. The authors are encouraged to comment in more detail on the significance of the effects of the Baccopa Monnieri extract that exhibited nearly 50% of the activity of SK.

Ans. As Fagonia Arabica showed 75% of clot lysis as compared to 86% clot lysis of SK, we concentrated first on this extract. However in the text (Discussion), significance of Baccopa monnieri extract on clot lysis is included along with the reference.

Note:
1. As the sentence about the side effects of herbal remedies compared to pharmaceuticals has been deleted along with the supporting reference, the next quoted number of the references has been changed accordingly.
The profibrinolytic effect of Dhamasa is of great potential interest. However, the presented study lacks some biochemical characterization experiments that aid how Dhamasa improves clot lysis. Does it act as a plasminogen activator? Does it act as plasmin? Does it destroy also fibrinogen?

Ans. Only Preliminary results of the study have been shown in the paper. However, the main causative component(s)/mechanism that lead to clot lysis by Dhamasa are yet to be investigated. Experiments are going on and at present we don't have enough data to conclude anything.

Major Compulsory Revisions

Q. Why did you use water instead of 0.9% NaCl as the vehicle?

Ans. The question is well taken. Initially we have prepared the herbal extracts in ethanol, methanol and in distilled water. Solubility of the herbal extracts was more in distilled water than the other two solvents. Hence, we proceeded with the aqueous preparation. However, we didn't use 0.9% NaCl as the vehicle but in future studies we could study and compare the results.

Q. The statistics section needs improvement, an accuracy of < 1 % is not probable.

Ans. Corrections in the statistics section have been made.

Minor Essential Revisions:

Q. Delete table 1

Ans. Table 1 corrected as per the statistical data.