Reviewer's report

Title: In vitro antibacterial activity of some plant essential oils

Version: 3 Date: 4 November 2006

Reviewer: Jenny Wilkinson

Reviewer's report:

General

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. Although the authors have updated the reference list the Discussion and, to a lesser extent, the Introduction are rather weak in terms of situating this study in the context of the available literature. There is considerable literature on oils such as lemon, lime, lavender citronella essential oils and not to discuss at least some of this literature seems to be ignoring what has already been done in terms of antibacterial activity of essential oils.

2. I also found the justification for selecting this particular set of oils rather weak particularly as the literature source on which the selection was made is now 30 years old.

3. The justification for doing GCMS on only cinnamon oil also seemed rather weak and I suggest that more information about the antibacterial activity of these oils might have been gained by analysing all the oils and correlating activity to chemical composition.

4. With respect to the statistical analysis presented in Table 2, the convention is to indicate those that are different rather than those that are not different.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Use SI units for symbols (eg h rather than hr)

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests