Reviewer’s report

Title: Antimicrobial activity of some ethnomedicinal plants used by Paliyar tribe from Tamil Nadu, India

Version: 2 Date: 10 July 2006

Reviewer: HECTOR GODOY

Reviewer’s report:

- Minor Essential Revisions

1. The Methods section is incomplete. The procedure for preparation of inocula should be described.

2. The following paragraph does not fit with data shown in Table 2.: “Only three plants (Olax scandens, Syzygium lineare and Peltophorum pterocarpum) showed activity against Klebsiella pneumonia, Escherichia coli and Proteus vulgaris...”. It should be corrected or removed, since the Table is self-explanatory.

3. The following statements should be removed:
   a) “This in vitro study demonstrated that folk medicine can be as effective as modern medicine to combat pathogenic microorganisms...”. No such demonstration derives from the present study.
   b) “In conclusion, the extracts of Toddalia asiatica, Syzygium lineare, Acalypha fruticosa and Peltophorum pterocarpum can be used for protection against some bacterial diseases...”. It is known that the “in vitro inhibitory activity of plant extracts is just an indicative and preliminary factor. Hundreds of plant extracts may have antimicrobial properties, but more advanced studies are required in order to show that they can be used for protection against bacterial diseases.

4. Many previous reports on the bioactivity of several plants studied in this work can be found in the literature, but only a few are quoted in the References. Perhaps the authors would wish to perform a more comprehensive literature review, remarking which are the authentically new findings.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.'