Author's response to reviews

Title: Aqueous extract of Terminalia arjuna prevents carbon tetrachloride induced hepatic and renal disorders

Authors:

Prasenjit Manna (prasenjitmanna2005@yahoo.co.in)
Mahua Sinha (sinha.mahua@rediffmail.com)
Parames C Sil (parames@bosemain.boseinst.ac.in)

Version: 3 Date: 26 July 2006

Author’s response to reviews:

July 26, 2006

Professor Emma Parkin
Associate Editor
BMC-series journals

Dear Prof. Parkin,

Thank you very much for giving us the opportunity to revise our manuscript [MS: 1840380899105995]. I am submitting herewith the revised manuscript entitled, "Aqueous extract of Terminalia arjuna prevents carbon tetrachloride induced hepatic and renal disorders" by Prasenjit Manna, Mahua Sinha and Parames C. Sil for consideration of publication in "BMC- Complementary and Alternative Medicine".

In order to answer to the question of the reviewer 1 (Y Ohta) regarding the determination of the parameters related to renal damage, I would like to mention that markers related to the renal damage were estimated even before submitting the original manuscript. As there was no change in either urea nitrogen or serum creatinine (non protein nitrogen) under our experimental conditions, we did not include that in the manuscript. However, we have included this observation in the discussion section in the revised manuscript (Page 15, line 8-15).

A recent report by Tirkey et al published in BMC Pharmacology [Reference No. 57 in our revised manuscript] supports our observation.

For your kind information, I would like to mention that all the modifications including this have been made in the revised manuscript following the point-by-point comments and suggestions raised by the reviewers. Answers to reviewers have been provided below.

Kindly acknowledge the receipt of the revised manuscript. I look forward to receive your decision at an early date.

Best regards

Dr. Parames C. Sil
Answers to Reviewers' Comments
(Reviewer : Y Ohta)

First of all I would like to thank the reviewer for his valuable comments and allowing us to revise the manuscript for consideration of publication in BMC Complementary and Alternative Medicine.

General

Typographical and grammatical errors have been corrected in the revised manuscript.

Major Compulsory Revisions

We would like to mention that markers related to the renal damage were estimated even before submitting the original manuscript. As there was no change in either the urea nitrogen or the serum creatinine (non protein nitrogen) under our experimental conditions, we did not include that in the original manuscript. However, we have included this observation in the discussion section in the revised manuscript (Page 15, line 8-15).


In addition, we are providing the data (in a table) here. If the reviewer feels that it should be included in the manuscript, it can be done.

Sample Normal CCl4 Treated

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Serum creatinine</td>
<td>0.63 ± 0.011</td>
<td>0.65 ± 0.012</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serum urea</td>
<td>27.45 ± 1.15</td>
<td>27.31 ± 1.11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urea creatinine</td>
<td>1.11 ± 0.041</td>
<td>1.15 ± 0.044</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We agree with the reviewer that for this particular study, BSA should not be used as a negative control and following his (her) suggestion negative control experiments have been deleted in the revised manuscript.
Following reviewers' suggestion, we have included a paragraph on "whether pretreatment......... by cytochrome P450 in the liver of mice" (Page 16, line 8-16).

Minor Essential Revisions

The correct expression of carbon tetrachloride radical [.CCl3] has been done in page 3.

The results in the "Result" section have been shortened as much as possible by deleting the values of determined components and enzymes.

Answers to Reviewers' Comments

(Reviewer : Kadir Batcioglu)

First of all I would like to thank the reviewer for his valuable comments on our manuscript and allowing us to revise the manuscript for consideration of publication in BMC Complementary and Alternative Medicine.

Minor Essential Revisions

1) As BSA is not playing any effect on the oxidative stress and damage, we also feel that BSA related experimental data should not be a part of this particular study. So, those data have been deleted.

2) Page 3: ".CCl4" has been replaced by".CCl3".

3) Page 3: "environmetal" has been replaced by "environmental".

4) Page 5: "gm" has been replaced by "g".

5) Page 6: "Determination of antioxidant activity in cell-free system" has been replaced "Determination of radical scavenger activity in cell-free system".

In the revised manuscript, discussion has been made more comprehensive.