Author's response to reviews

Title: Potentized homeopathic drug, Chelidonium-30 and Chelidonium-200, can ameliorate genotoxicity induced by p-Dimethylaminoazobenzene (p-DAB) in mice and modulate enzymatic activities in different organs during hepatocarcinogenesis

Authors:

Surjyo Jyoti Biswas (surjyobiswas@yahoo.com)
Anisur Rahman Khuda-Bukhsh (arkb@klyuniv.ernet.in)

Version: 2 Date: 2 Feb 2002

From:
Dr. A.R. Khuda-Bukhsh, Ph.D.
Reader.

To
Ms Emma Veitch 02.02.02
Assistant Editor,
Biomedcentral, Middlesex House,
34-42 Cleveland,
London W1T 4LB
Ref: 158424179101361: Potentized homeopathic drugs Chelidonium-30............during hepatocarcinogenesis.

Dear Ms Emma Veitch,

I am resubmitting herewith our revised paper after taking care of the hon'ble referees' observations and suggestions.
The revised paper has dealt with the following and made suitable changes accordingly:

Response on Referee Dr. T. Tanaka:
1. A pathological table be provided: The study was not primarily intended to record pathological changes as such, but was mainly concerned with the ameliorating ability of the homeopathic drugs on the tumorigenic and genotoxic effects of the carcinogens (p-DAB and PB). However, the authors agree with the hon'ble reviewer that data on pathological changes would have been of wider interest. Therefore, we decided to provide a small table (Table-1) in which some salient histo-pathological data recorded by us in this investigation have been included.
2. No information on whether the "pale reddish multiple nodules" are preneoplastic: Necessary reference (Daoust and Molnar, 1964; No. 10) has now been provided to indicate that these reddish multiple nodules do represent a preneoplastic growth (tumor). The previously presented Ref. 10 of Ohmi et al, 1981 was deleted to accommodate the new reference as there are other references in support of the subsequent statement in the text (Ref. 11-12).
3. Abbreviations of p-DAB and PB be carefully checked: Indeed there were a few mistakes in the abbreviations, some presented as p-DAB while others as only DAB. Now it has been correctly depicted as p-DAB in each case.
4. Names of journals be carefully described: Yes, the names of journals have now been checked and carefully described, e.g. Japanese J. Can. Res has been changed to the correct form, i.e. Jpn. J. Cancer Res.; Human Exp. Toxicol has been changed to Human exp. Toxicol.

Responses to the hon'ble reviewer DR. H. Kasai

1. The paper be slightly reduced, particularly figures and discussion: Out of 14 figures originally submitted, as many as six figures have now been deleted and the necessary changes in denoting figure numbers in text have been made for the 8 figures which were retained. To reduce some parts of "discussion", several sentences have now been deleted from the original text without altering references; e.g. "This seems to be a dramatic finding.........growth in mice-Discussion, 9th line; "A search of literature....although" 18th line; "On the other hand", line 22nd; Next para : "The observation of reduced frequency.........spleen and kidney" have been deleted.

As the other reviewer did not want any reduction in the discussion, with whom we completely agree for the sake of justifying the strength of the paper, we made the maximum possible reduction in "discussion" only in order to honor the 2nd reviewer's view.

Response to Assistant Editor's suggestions:

Mention has now been made of the Ethical clearance although previously also it was mentioned in the MATERIALS AND METHODS section that the animals were reared under the supervision of the Animal Welfare Committee, which, incidentally is also empowered to oversee the ethical issues in doing animal experimentations in our University (an Autonomous Body). One key word has been included, i.e. homeopathy.

I hope, the paper would now be finally accepted for publication in your esteemed on-line journal at an early date. It is certified that my co-author, Mr. SurjyoJyoti Biswas also approves of the changes made in the revised manuscript. Minor editorial changes for the sake of better expression of facts will be acceptable.

With kindest regards,

Yours sincerely,

(A.R. Khuda-Bukhsh)

Dr.A.R. Khuda-Bukhsh, Ph.D.
Reader, Department of Zoology,
University of Kalyani,
Kalyani-741235, W.B., India.