Author’s response to reviews

Title: Antispasmodic and antidiarrhoeal activity of the fruit of Rosa moschata (J)

Authors:

Niaz Ali Dr (niazpharmacist@yahoo.com)
Hina Alam (pharmacist334@yahoo.com)
Aslam Khan Dr (aslamkhan_mkd@yahoo.com.uk)
Ghayour Ahmad (pharmacist@gmail.com)
Wadood Ali Shah (wadudalishah@yahoo.com)
Muhammad Nabi (mnabipharmacist@gmail.com)
Muhammad Junaid (juniphdr@gmail.com)

Version: 4 Date: 18 October 2014

Author’s response to reviews: see over
Reviewer: Dr Gerald Ngo Teke

Title: Antispasmodic and antidiarrhoeal activity of the fruit of Rosa moschata (J)

Major Revision

Some titles are not the best:

Answer: the titles are revised as suggested.

Figure 1: ‘Effect of acute treatment of Rosa moschata extract on % survivors of mice.

Figure 3: Effect of different concentrations of Rm.Cr (A) and verapamil on Ca++ concentration-response curves in isolated rabbits’ jejunal preparations (Mean ± SEM, n=5-7).

Figure 2 and 3: Yes it is “% of control maximum” not the “% of control”

We have corrected as suggested.

Minor essential revision

In addition to grammar corrections, other corrections as suggested are rectified in the manuscript file.

However, following changes are mentioned here separately for convenience of the editors.

L 64: Are you referring to biliary infection? ... cases and in bilious affections...

Answer: It is “bilious affection” not “biliary infection” as reported in literature.

L 160: add the phrase indicated... group as positive control. 10 mL/kg of castor oil (p.o.) was given to all the groups after one hour ‘post extract/test sample treatment’.

Answer: The phrase is added as suggested.

L 166: which statistical tool was used to analyze data collected?

Answer: Graph Pad prism was used. It is now mentioned in the Data analysis section

L 173 -174 ... profile of the samples which may determines that it can be possible candidate for a development of herbal product.

It is better as ‘... profile of the sample making it a possible candidate for the development
of herbal products’. You may adjust otherwise.

Answer: Adjusted the sentence as suggested.

L 177-184: Too long a sentence: For this purpose this study was..... and 0.16 (0.13 – 0.21), respectively (Fig. 2B). Try to adjust this.

Answer: The sentence is divided into two sentences.

Reviewer's report 2

Title: Antispasmodic and antidiarrhoeal activity of the fruit of Rosa moschata (J)

Version: 5 October 2014

Reviewer: Theophine Okoye

Reviewer's report:

Major revisions

(1) The sentence on lines 55-56 should be revised to correct the repetitions therein.

Action taken: The sentence has been revised as per suggestion other reviewer. Hence it is addressed automatically.

(2) The authors need to explain in details the statement on line 65 that the extract possess laxative effects since it’s been used and assessed for its antispasmodic and antidiarrhoeal activity.

Action taken: The sentence is elaborated to explain its use as laxative agent. As no specific “part used” have been refernced thereby providing a space for resaerchers to explore.

(3) Sentence on line 72-73 should be revised to convey the intended meaning.

Action taken: Sentences are revised to give explicit meaning now.

(4) Line 110; the method of acute toxicity studies need to be mentioned in addition to the reference.

Action taken: The author’s name is now mentioned as asked.
(5) In the entire manuscript, always give a space between figures and SI units, eg, “1000 mg/kg” and “LD50” should be “LD50”, that is written as a subscript.

**Action Taken:** Corrections as suggested have been incorporated elsewhere in the manuscript.

**Minor Revision**

(1) The word ‘to’ in line 75 to be deleted.
    **Action taken:** the word “to” is deleted
(2) Comma should be inserted to the figure in line 54.
    **Action taken:** Comma is inserted as suggested.
(3) Line 64 ‘affections’ or ‘infections’?
    **Action taken:** it is affections not infections.
(4) Correct the spelling of spasm on line 75.
    **Action taken:**
(5) Insert proper symbols on line 84.
    **Action taken:** proper “degree” symbol is inserted as suggested.
(6) On line 106 ‘bhaddray’ should be upper case if its somebody’s name.
    **Action taken:** It is corrected as suggested.
(7) Line 116, ‘kept on fasting’ should be changed to ‘fasted’.
    **Action taken:** Rectified as suggested
(8) Line 167 values ‘were’ not ‘are’. So change.
    **Action taken:** The sentence is corrected accordingly.

We thank the reviewers for giving their valued inputs to make this manuscript of standard.

Regards!

Dr. Niaz Ali
Associate Professor Pharmacology, Khyber Medical University Pakistan