Reviewer’s report

Title: Angelica sinensis Extract Inhibits RANKL-mediated Osteoclastogenesis by Down-regulated the Expression of NFATc1 in Mouse Bone Marrow Cells

Version: 2 Date: 3 September 2014

Reviewer: Daewon Jeong

Reviewer’s report:

The manuscript of L. Yu and colleagues suggests that the extract isolated from Angelica sinensis (AS) suppresses RANKL-induced osteoclast differentiation by down-regulating MAPKs and transcription factors including NF-kB, AP-1 and NFATc1. Despite in vitro results for AS at the cellular level, this study is of no scientific interest at this stage. Thus, this study is required to meet one of the two major comments as follows.

Major comments
1. The inhibitory effect of AS on osteoclastogenesis should be confirmed by using a single compound or mixed compounds composed by the combination of single compound.
2. Since AS was known as a suppressive activity in inflammatory diseases, this study should be proven by using animal models with inflammatory (collagen, RANKL, LPS or interleukin)-induced osteoporosis to suggest a possible positive modulator of AS against osteoporotic bone diseases, especially in inflammatory-mediated bone destruction.

Minor points
1. Reference number 1 and 17 are overlapped and references are not decorated to reference format with some error misprints such as comma and space.
2. Because this study has no data related to osteoclast activation and function, the last sentence of Introduction part is removed or required to modify the sentence.
3. The MS described different concentration of MCSF and RANKL in osteoclast differentiation as mentioned in the section of Abstract and Methods.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.