Reviewer's report

Title: Potential anti-osteoporotic effects of herbal extracts on osteoclasts, osteoblasts and chondrocytes in vitro

Version: 2 Date: 10 July 2013

Reviewer: Olga Meiri Chaim

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
The main criticism is about the quality of microscopy images, which are impossible to evaluate or make any consideration due to the much reduced size. Additionally, more information must be extracted further analyzing the morphological changes, and then confronting with RT-PCRq assays results. Osteoblast differentiation and osteoclast behavior are poorly observed in the images. In the same way, bone extracellular matrix (ECM) is a relevant issue not quite mentioned or further commented in the discussion as being part of the turnover or/and recovering after herbal extracts treatment. Is it a consequence or stimuli triggered by the root extracts? Is there any relationship Cell-ECM?

My major revision request is to give more attention for microscopy results, which in the present form are inappropriate. Thus, enlarging the images is critical. As necessary, it might be discard some redundant images of doses or time of exposition, and I would not see it as a problem.