Reviewer's report

Title: Nigella Sativa improves osteoporosis in ovariectomized rats

Version: 1 Date: 7 October 2013

Reviewer: Ritu Trivedi

Reviewer's report:

Study by Ansam Aly Seif on Nigella Sativa improves osteoporosis in ovariectomized rats is a well tempted one but needs several answers before authentically proving that Nigella sativa has improved effect in osteoporosis.

1. Toxicity data with Nigella sativa has not been given.
2. From where was this extract acquired.
3. Data of BMD would be very informative as it would be quantitative in nature as compared to histology that is empirical way of interpreting data.
4. Author should address the estrogenicity of Nigella sativa by uterus examination. It is one of the most important parameter as estrogens are known to have deleterious effect on the uterus and breast. Since Nigella sativa is plant derived, it is important to assess the estrogenicity profile of this extract.
5. There is more explanation about TNF and IL-6 but no experimental data. Inflammatory cytokines analysis will be more informative as nigellone and thymoquinone show anti-inflammatory response.
6. To be sure about the activity achieved by Nigell sativa positive control like Alendronate or iPTH would be more informative.
7. Compararison with only OVx group only will be more informative.
8. Materials and Method section should involve all experimental process.
9. Oxidative stress measurement parameter will be for informative as discussed in discussion.
10. Author should discuss dosing of NS for 4 weeks before ovariectomy and continuation for 12 weeks.