Reviewer's report

Title: Identifying Chinese Herbal Medicine for Premenstrual Syndrome: Implications from a Nationwide Database

Version: 1 Date: 10 April 2014

Reviewer: Su Hee Jang

Reviewer's report:

- Major Compulsory Revisions

Introduction
#1. Line 8. No def of PMDD. Need to add what PMDD is whether it is part of PMS or a type of PMS.

3.1 Demographic of TCM users
#2 Line 5. Unclear on 5.4 CHM. Is it 5.4 different single herbs or 5.4 different formula? Need clarification.

4. Discussion
#3 Line 8. Latest systematic review needs reference.
#4 Paragraph 3, line 9. Anti-oxidative effects are reported. needs reference.
Line 11. The anti-oxidative effects exclusively found in SH... needs reference.
#5 the dosages of all the herbal formula mentioned in this study needs to be identified,

#6 The only information on CHM mentioned were the names However, are there any more information on how much CHMs patients have taken? Are there any information on the duration of the intake, the frequency of the intake per day? Did all patients visit the doctors only once for the medication or several times? Were each patient given different kinds of CHM each visit or the same kinds of CHM at each visit? When were the CHM taken?(was it during PMS, or in between cycles?) Needs clarification on the above information, if not, mention the reasons why the above information is omitted.

#7 Are there any info on patients’ severity of PMS and correlations between the severity and the CHM given? Needs mentioning of the info. If not, explain why so.

#8 there are more systematic reviews on PMS. Need to add them and add possible CHMs that were identified (e.g. Jing Z, Yang X, Ismail KMK, Chen XY, Wu T. Chinese herbal medicine for premenstrual syndrome. Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews 2009, Issue 1. Art. No.: CD006414. DOI: 10.1002/14651858.CD006414.pub2.).
are there any adverse events to the CHMs mentioned in the review?

Figure

Explanation of the figure should be spaced right under the figure for more clarification.

Material & method

Need to mention how many investigators searched the DB and who by initials (e.g. The study selection was performed independently by two investigators (Chang KD, Willwood J).

Risk of bias assessment in searching, synthesizing, Quality and validity Assessment should be added.

Need to mention author’s participation. Who are responsible for what part of the article.

- Minor Essential Revisions

Periods at the end of every sentence ending with a reference should be placed after the reference number. (e.g. 1. Introduction. Line 4. …disrupt their normal life [1].

Texts needs justification-alignment correction needed.

Abstract

Result: Line 1. Sentence is incomplete. English correction needed.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.