Reviewer’s report

Title: Antifungal activities of essential oil extract of Carpobrotus edulis (L.) Bolus

Version: Date: 3 January 2014

Reviewer: khaled el-massry

Reviewer’s report:

Regarding my review for the submitted research article under the title:
Antifungal activities of essential oil extract of Carpobrotus edulis (L.) Bolus’
Beauty E Omoruyi, Anthony A.J Afolayan and Graeme Bradley

Please let me inform the followings:

1- Generally the research article is very interesting, especially with looking for natural compounds fighting microorganism not only for food industries but also on the health side.

2- First the title; the author study the activities of both essential oil as well as different extracts of the same plant, yet he did not mentioned it in the title. So he should take in his consideration that one.

3- Also. Abstract; he should state in this part … To isolate and analyze the chemical composition of the essential oil of Carpobrotus edulis (L.) Bolus and antifungal activities of plant leaves extracts (essential oil, hexane, acetone and ethanol).

4- Page 1 in results: should put respectively after monoterpenes (line3).

5- Introduction: at the end of this part the author put (Essential oils and their components in this study were observed to be more active…………………………… alternative medicines) this is not here he should write clearly the aim of his research.

6- Experimental Approachleaf : Plant material; Fresh leaves instead leaf material.

7- Results and Discussion: page 9 leaves analyzed instead leaf analysed.
Regarding the major components identified by GC/MS, it should reconsider as he mentioned that tetradecamethylcycloheptasiloxane (23.81%) not 23.76% and it should be the major as the other one 22.51%.

8- On going through the text, the author did not mentioned that he had studied the chemical composition of the plant solvent extract (phenolic contents, flavonoids,…etc) to explain the biological activity against the fungi used in this study.

9- He also did not mentioned that he had a previous study regarding this target (ref. 11) and I wonder why as it deal with the antioxidant and phytochemical
properties of Carpobrotus edulis (L.) Bolus leaf used for the management of common infections .................. (2012).

10- Also, would you mind let me know how the author could identified different fatty acids and its methyl esters in the essential oil (19.25%) inspite he did not mentioned anything regarding methylation.

Finally, beside such great effort to reach this results, I wish that the author reconsider all these remarks and put the whole article in the proper form and return it to me to look through it.

Decision : Acceptance after amending.

Thanks again and looking to hear from you so soon.

Prof.Dr. Khaled F. El-massry